

101st System Development Committee Meeting

Date: 25 January 2024

Time: 09.00 - 17.00h

Place: ENTSO-E offices, rue de Spa 8, 1000 Brussels

Participants (*physical*)

Chairman

	Amprion	Germany
--	---------	---------

Vice Chairman

	RTE	France
--	-----	--------

Special invitees

1.	ENTSO-E Secretary-General	
2.	Chair of the System Operations Committee	France

Members

1.	50Hertz Transmission	Germany
2.	Amprion	Germany
3.	Ceps	Czech Republic
4.	Creos Luxembourg (<i>Proxy to Amprion</i>)	Luxembourg
5.	Elering	Estonia
6.	EMS	Serbia
7.	Energinet	Denmark
8.	Fingrid (<i>Proxy to Svenska Kraftnät</i>)	Finland
9.	HOPS	Croatia
10.	IPTO	Greece
11.	RTE	France
12.	Statnett	Norway
13.	Svenska Kraftnät	Sweden
14.	TenneT TSO BV	Netherlands

Substitutes

15.	Elia System Operator	Belgium
16.	REE	Spain
17.	REN	Portugal
18.	TenneT TSO GmbH	Germany
19.	Terna	Italy

Conveners StGs and WGs and RGs

1.	StG WG Scenario Building and WG System Design Strategy	Netherlands
2.	StG ERAA 2023	Austria
3.	Offshore Network Development Plan Core Group	Denmark
4.	WG Assets, Implementation and Management	Slovakia
5.	Policy & Communication Group	Italy
6.	RG Continental South-West	Spain
7.	RG Continental South-East	Serbia
8.	RG Continental Central East	Czech Republic
9.	RG Baltic Sea	Germany

Secretariat

1.	ENTSO-E	
----	---------	--

Participants (*remote*)

Members & Substitutes

20.	APG	Austria
21.	ESO-EAD	Bulgaria
22.	AS Augstsprieguma tīkls	Latvia
23.	Crnogorski elektroprenosni sistem AD	Montenegro
24.	Eirgrid	Ireland
25.	Eles	Slovenia
26.	Mavir	Hungary
27.	MEPSO	Republic of North Macedonia
28.	OST-Operatori i Sistemit te Transmetimit	Albania
29.	PSE	Poland
30.	Seps	Slovakia
31.	SONI	Northern Ireland
32.	Swissgrid	Switzerland
33.	Transelectrica	Romania
34.	Transmission System Operator-Cyprus	Cyprus
35.	TransnetBW	Germany
36.	Ukrenergo	Ukraine
37.	VUEN	Austria

Conveners StGs, WGs and RGs

1.	StG Connection Network Codes	Germany
2.	StG TYND	Spain
3.	RG Continental Central South	Italy

Excused

37.	Landsnet	Iceland
38.	Litgrid	Lithuania
39.	NOSBiH	Bosnia&Herzegovina

1. Attendance, quorum and approval of draft Agenda

The Chair of the Committee welcomed all Committee members, as well as the Secretary-General of ENTSO-E and the Chair of the System Operations Committee for their participation.

He also welcomed the member from Ukrenergo, who is attending his first Committee meeting since becoming a full member of ENTSO-E.

He also welcomed the new Committee member from Amprion.

The meeting was quorate. The agenda was endorsed without further updates.

DECISION

36 out of 40 of the TSOs represented in the System Development Committee are attending the meeting, the SDC Chair states that the Committee meeting reaches the necessary quorum of half its members.

2. Welcome by the ENTSO-E Secretary-General

The Secretary General shared view on the role of SDC's work in the association, the positioning in the public debate of all planning products and commends the efforts to develop new data processes and platforms and reach more member resource contributions.

3. ONDP launch on 23 January 2024

The Chair highlighted the work of the ONDP Central Group and Regional Group Convenors to deliver the first ENTSO-E Offshore Network Development Plans which were launched this week in a high-level meeting and technical webinar, both with impressive attendance. He extended a special thanks to the ONDP Core Group, the involved Regional Group members and Secretariat for coordinating all assessments and the report drafting.

4. Report from Board meeting, 23 November 2023, and Assembly meeting 14 December 2023

The Chairman summarised the main topics of interest to the SDC discussed at recent Board and Assembly meetings. He invited the Committee to share their views with the input to the next Board meeting, at which the ERAA 2023 process will be examined and coordination with the gas industry will be discussed.

5. SD Programme Management

5.1. SDC Dashboard: Progress on products and resources

Discussion within the SD Programme Management focused on the TYNDP timeline, where delays in scenario development are impacting the date of release of the system needs study and CBA. The Committee supported the need for a formal statement of implications and external causes.

5.2 Communication Plans of SD products in 2024

The Secretariat's SD Programme Manager presented the main communication milestones in 2024. A strategy/risk mitigation plan will be developed for specific products. The SDC Chair asked the responsible team to investigate the possibility to advance the release of the Winter Outlook also in next editions.

5.3 Final ToRs of SDC Programme Management

The approval of the ToRs is postponed accommodating new comments given up to the date of the Committee meeting.

6. European policy update

The PCG Vice Convenor shared updates on legislative files such as NZIA, EMDR, F-gas regulation and the gas/H2 package.

7. View from other Committees

7.1. SOC activities including Q&A session

The SOC Chair informed the Committee on the present structure of the SOC and main activities.

7.2 Report from ICTC council

The Systems Modelling Manager shared an IT map of SD applications and ongoing investigations for further improvements. There is an opportunity to push market modelling activities onto a Common Private Cloud infrastructure once the ENTSO-E Cloud policy is approved by ICTC. The future use of CIMdesk is being considered. The replacement of NMD is examined, possibly extending the use of the PEMMDB App as an alternative and an opportunity to make a strong link between market data and grid data while retaining the ability to run separate data collections.

The D&M StG will focus on financial applications, business continuity and efficiencies.

8. EU Grid Action Plan

8.1. Progress report via EG Grid Infrastructure

The Head of Section provided information on the recently published EU Grid Action Plan. The Expert Group on Grid Infrastructure (which reports to the Board) has analysed the activities that can be carried out in Committee and the new initiatives that need to be put in place.

9. Offshore Cost Sharing Group (status and perspective)

9.1. PT CBCS progress report and review of EC “study on the allocation of costs and benefits for offshore infrastructure in all sea basins”

The leader of the PT CBCS (from MC) updated the SDC on team activities, the review of the EC study allocation on costs and benefits and a high-level description of the different tasks related to Article 15.2 of TEN-E. Committee members discussed the strategic nature of this new task and the links between CBCS and CBCA.

9.2. Report on CBCA questionnaire

The WG SDS Convenor informed the SDC about the internal CBCA Survey conducted. The survey, which collected views from 18 TSOs, observes that if all parties agree to use CBCA for cost distribution, the process is considered legally clear enough. However, it is also acknowledged to be very time-consuming. Successful cases involve allocating costs between countries with NRA approval and applying for CEF funds.

The WG SDS Convenor emphasized that the EC and ACER were looking for an evolving CBCA approach, going beyond the current successes. Furthermore, the ex-ante method used to define benefits is seen as a weak point in the methodology. This is due to its focus on SEW benefits, lack of an integrated system view, and reliance on scenarios that change every two years.

The survey showcases that the current approach exhibits adverse effects when applied to a massive offshore infrastructure buildout, and attention is needed for negatively impacted TSOs/MSs.

Motivated by the unprecedented costs and benefits at stake by Wind offshore deployment, the issue has been raised, whether the historical CBCA mechanism is “fit-for (this) purpose”.

The WG SDS was pleased to note that there have been diverse proposals for improvements, primarily reflecting the perspectives of offshore and onshore countries. The work is to be intensified in close alignment between MC and SDC.

10. StG Connection Network Codes

10.1 ACER submission to EC of NC RfG and DC

DECISION

The SDC:

- takes note of the CNC amendment progress.

The StG CNC Convenor informed about the CNC amendment process. He highlighted the key points of ACER’s recommendation on NC RfG and NC DC and points out that ACER did not consider ENTSO-E’s proposal on RoCoF. He added that ACER plans to launch a public consultation on NC HVDC draft amendments by end of March 2023, beginning of April 2024.

The StG CNC Convenor mentioned that the study on frequency defense plan and recommendation was finished by the RGCE SDP group that support the NC RfG and NC DC exhaustive parameters.

The Committee expressed concerns that the RoCoF immunity criteria is significantly reduced in ACER’s recommendation. Already in about 17 Member States the RoCoF requirement is twice as stringent i.e., 2

Hz/s. It is noted that ENTSO-E can demonstrate that it is technically feasible for some, while manufacturers have raised that large machines cannot provide the initially proposed RoCoF requirements.

10.2 NC Demand Response flexibility and impact on NC DC

The StG CNC Convenor informed about the StG CNC recommendation of keeping Title III in NC DC instead of moving it to NC DR as was recommended by the ACER Framework Guidelines. StG CNC will support a proposal for alignment and harmonization of terminology so that the NC DR can directly be referred to the NC DC.

One member abstained from the decision vote.

DECISION

The SDC:

- takes note of the assessment on demand response provisions in the NC DC and the draft NC DR.

10.3 Implementation Monitoring Report 2023

The StG CNC Convenor informed about monitoring activities. He noted that StG CNC decided to ask NCLPs to assess the need of developing the Implementation Monitoring Report in future, and to report back to the Committee with a proposal in the next meeting.

The Committee noted that the report may have limited value now since NC RfG is in place for a number of years but will become more relevant again when amendments enter into force.

DECISION

The SDC:

- approves the 5th edition of the “Monitoring Report on Connection Network Codes Implementation”.

10.4. Gap analysis between current CNC and related technical standards

The StG CNC Convenor shared main highlights of the report, which will be used in engagements with ACER.

10.5. IGDs work plan 2024

The StG CNC Convenor informed about IGD topics for next years and highlights two prioritized topics such as a grid forming and forced oscillation. He mentioned an IGD on grid forming to complement the NC RfG which has a non-exhaustive requirement on this. An external study is ongoing to support this IGD.

11. Scenario Building 2024

11.1. Progress report

The Scenario Building Convenor presented the status of the Scenario Building process with the recent approval of the NT+ scenario within the Steering Group. The Committee discussed the shortcomings identified in the process and how to handle them transparently in the report. The Committee asked for a stricter engagement with ENTSOE to mitigate further risks on quality and delays in the process.

One member voted against; five members abstained.

DECISION

The SDC:

- acknowledges the StG decision to approve the NT+ 2030 and NT+ 2040 scenario modelling outputs.
- acknowledges not all integrated planning improvements could be made in this cycle and agrees to address this with an explanation in the Scenario Report.

11.2. Scenario Stakeholder Reference Group Engagement

The Scenario Building Convenor presented the Scenarios Stakeholder Reference Group (SRG) Terms of Reference and ENTSO-E's proposed rules of engagement with the SRG.

DECISION

The SDC:

- takes note of the reporting and the Scenarios Stakeholder Reference Group (SRG) Terms of Reference.
- approves the proposed rules of engagement with the Scenarios SRG.

12. TYNDP 2024

12.1 Progress report

The TYNDP StG Convenor presented the progress of the TYNDP and the compressed timeline for delivery in 2024.

12.2. Final project list for TYNDP 2024

The TYNDP Project Manager presented the analysis of administrative criteria for acceptance of projects in TYNDP. There are a limited number of projects with pending documentation still. Approval will take place soon via written process.

12.3. CBCS and CBA scope and structure

The Secretariat presented the scope of Sea Basin CBA and Sea Basin CBCS and shared a proposal how SDC could organize itself for these tasks. This includes an overview of the overall development process with roles and responsibilities of the different groups involved across Committees, Board and Assembly.

Further set-up details will also be discussed in the TYNDP StG as this group remains responsible for the CBA methodology and will supervise the integration of ONDPs in the TYNDP process in the next cycle. The Committee noted that as this activity requires further effort and has a strategic dimension, a new call for members needs to be set up soon.

Two members voted against the decision.

DECISION

The SDC:

- supports the intention to merge the ONDP Central Group and the DT CBA into a new entity focused on Cost Benefit Analysis and Cost Sharing methodologies and implementation guidance.

12.4. ENTSO-E TF Interlinked Model

The Long-Term Planning Manager, based on guidance from the Committee in previous meetings, presented the proposed structure to improve the support to the ILM workstream. The Committee discussed this with several new views and asked the Programme Management to define and implement a new structure and inform SDC in the next meeting.

DECISION

The SDC:

- reconfirms the strategic relevance of ENTSO-E's active involvement in the ILM workstream.

13. ERAA 2023

13.1. Progress report

The Adequacy Manager gave a status update. After the report submission to ACER on 15 December 2023, ACER's preliminary position was received by ENTSO-E on 17 January 2024, and is being reviewed, with involvement of legal experts, Steering Group and the SDC Chair. In parallel and independent to the ACER procedure, a stakeholder consultation was launched from 18 December 2023 until 31 January 2023.

DECISION

The SDC:

- takes note of the progress regarding ACER's forthcoming decision on ERAA2023.

14. ERAA 2024

14.1. ERAA Steering Group endorsement

The Adequacy Manager noted that recent editions of ERAA have seen an increase in the number of applicants, demonstrating TSO interest in ERAA. The SDC Chair and several members of the Committee pointed out that an increase in the size of the Steering Group can compromise efficiency and create a situation where the Steering Group members represent the interests of the TSOs more than the objectives of the Committee as defined in the PID.

The Steering Group is approved with an option to review in coming months on the basis of progress, efficiency, contributions and further focus of the group.

DECISION

The SDC:

- approves the nominations from Amprion, APG, CEPS, Elia, PSE, REE, REN, RTE, Svenska Kraftnat, TenneT TSO BV, Terna and TransnetBW as members of an enlarged ERAA 2024 Steering Group, mandated to represent the view of the Committee in line with the ERAA 2024 PID, with a possibility for review by June.

15. TF ERAA repurposing

15.1. Progress report

The Secretariat's Adequacy Expert updated the Committee on the progress in the Task Force ERAA Repurposing. The group is preparing an internal strategy paper for Committee and Board review. The main pillars of this paper are presented to the Committee and relate to reassessing the objective and methodology of EVA, accounting for the key uncertainties that impact the European Power System, the complementarity of National Resource Adequacy Assessments (NRAA) and scenario/sensitivities selection.

DECISION

The SDC:

- SDC acknowledges the progress of the TF ERAA Repurposing in reviewing a future ERAA scope beyond the 2024 edition.

16. Data & Models

16.1. Dashboard

The System Modelling Manager highlighted the key points of the Dashboard.

DECISION

The SDC:

- takes note of the StG Data & Models Dashboard updates.
- takes note of the PECD 4 publication via the Copernicus Web Application as agreed in the ECMWF MoU.

16.2. Progress of ERAA 2024 data collection

The Secretariat brought positive news that the PEMMDB Data Collection is successfully closed. All TSOs delivered timely data and most of the LACs confirmed the new PEMMDB App's ease of use. Due to some encountered technical issues, a two-week delay is foreseen in the data delivery for ERAA 2024 Public Consultation and in the final data release. The System Modelling Team thanks the LACs for their engagement and responsiveness throughout the data collection process. The Demand Data Collection is still running for 15 TSOs, LACs are invited to provide demand timeseries as soon as possible not to pose a risk to the timeline. The Chair congratulates the team and all LACs for this smooth process.

16.3. Grid Model request for EU research project

The System Modelling manager raised an informal request from a publicly funded research project to access the TYNDP dataset and develop a simplified/anonymised model for their study and make it public. The Committee noted that the existing process for dataset sharing needs to be reviewed with options to make it simpler to ensure transparency, clear terms of use and ensuring TSO confidentiality restrictions are respected. The StG D&M is asked to assess options for SDC and Board consideration.

DECISION

The SDC:

- approves the recommendations for next steps.

17. WG Asset Implementation & Management

17.1. Status of JTF DESAP and next actions

The convenor of WG AIM informed about the status of the JTF DESAP. He mentioned the JTF started looking for experts to work on the deliverables and that it is a good idea to have more representatives of asset planning departments of TSOs in the taskforce.

18. Elections

18.1. SDC Vice Chair for a 2nd term

The SDC re-elected the SDC Vice-Chair for a 2nd term.

DECISION

The SDC:

- confirms the present Vice-Chair of the SDC for another two-year term starting on 26 January 2024.
- re-confirms the SDC Vice-Chair in the role of SDC Programme Manager

18.2. Convenor StG Connection Network Codes for a 2nd term

The SDC re-elected the Convenor of the StG CNC for a 2nd term.

DECISION

The SDC:

- re-confirms the present Convenor of the Steering Group Connection Network Codes (StG CNC) for another two-year term starting on 26 January 2024.

18.3. Convenor of StG Data & Models

The SDC welcomed the nomination from CEPS to lead the StG D&M.

DECISION

The SDC:

- elects the new Convenor of the Steering Group Data & Models (StG D&M) for a two-year term starting on 26 January 2024.

18.4. Next mandate of the RG CCS convenorship

The Committee noted the re-election by RG CCS of its Convenor from Terna.

13. Any Other Business

No other points were raised.

14. Approval of the Decisions

All decisions as voted and shown during the meeting are considered approved.