

# How to improve transparency in CC ENTSO-E Recommendation

MESC 4<sup>th</sup> September

---

# Disclaimer and next steps

It is a set of non-binding recommendations aiming at providing guidance to the CCR on how to improve the transparency in the capacity calculation process.

ENTSO-E and the CCRs are working on an action plan for implementing this Recommendation.

The potential implementation means are (non-exhaustive):

- publication of detailed methodologies and dedicated explanatory documents by CCRs (i.e. on ENTSO-E regional websites)
- publication of additional data by CCR coordinated capacity calculators
- publication of additional data on the Transparency Platform
- provision of dedicated tools for market participants

# Stakeholders expectations towards CapCalc

## Ex-ante indicators

- Understand how capacities are calculated and optimised

## Ex-post indicators

- Understand what limited the capacity, how the grid was used and which measures were taken to mitigate contingencies

# Different types of data and actions

## General publication of data

- List of CNECs, NTCs, FB parameters, etc.
- Generally, this type of data is expected to be published on dedicated communication platforms toward NRAs and Market Participants

## Monitoring and information

- It focuses on assessment of capacity calculation attributes
- It is expected to be published to NRAs only

## Reviews and updates

- Reviews of certain sub-methodologies of the CCM and inputs for the CC, such as e.g. Operational security limits, GSK, Reliability margins, CNECs methodologies
- It is expected to be published to both NRAs and Market Participants

**→ This Recommendation to improve CC transparency can cover all above types of data**

# Recommendations to TSOs and CCRs on the publication of ex-ante indicators

## CNECs data (FB/CNTC)

**Current status:** Published for FB, not for NTC

**Recommendation:**

- Publication of CNECs - full non-anonymization for both FB and NTC (where possible due to critical infrastructure legislation)
- Publication of the parameters for FB: CWE FB as a benchmark
- Publication of the following parameters for NTC: NAME, NAME contingency, XB/internal line, thermal capacity.
- Display an alert when new CNECs/contingency is added into the CC proces

**Possible next step:** Further information on the threshold for CNECs selection or additional relevant parameters for NTC

## Remedial actions (FB/CNTC)

**Current status:** No publication (RA optimizer planned in CWE ID, CORE, Italy North, maybe Channel/SWE, but no publication)

**Recommendation:**

- Publication of non-costly RA taken into account in CC – i.e. type of action, localization of action (which element)

**Possible next step:** Further information on the use of RA

# Recommendations to TSOs and CCRs on the publication of ex-ante indicators

## Flow-based domain extension in DA (FB)

**Current status:** no publication

**Possible next step:** Further information on the “LT patch”

## Physical maximum flows interconnectors (FB/NTC)

**Current status:** no harmonized approach (some TSOs publish on their websites, while others do not)

**Recommendation:**

- Publication of thermal capacities\* of at least all XB lines – i.e. using interactive ENTSO-E map (e.g. winter and summer)

**Possible next step:** Further information on maximum physical flow (to be also defined)

## GSK (FB/NTC)

**Current status:** publication of the methodologies for GSKs (though quite general)

**Recommendation:**

- Provide further details on GSKs methodologies, i.e. as a part of capacity calculation methodology or explanatory document

**Possible next step:** Further information on GSKs – only possible if Generators agree

\* disclaimer: It shall be highlighted that this parameter should be published (where possible) only in the context of enhancing transparency on the electricity grid, and is not proposed to directly enhance transparency on capacity calculation: indeed, it must be avoided that thermal capacities are compared one-to-one to cross-border available trading capacities for which a whole capacity calculation process is needed

# Recommendations to TSOs and CCRs on the publication of ex-post indicators

## CNECs (FB/CNTC)

**Current status:** Limiting CNECs published for FB, and not NTC

**Recommendation:**

- Publish list of limiting CNECs also for NTC when possible

**Possible next step:** Further information on shadow prices of CNECs from market coupling and shadow volumes

## Realized physical flows per BZ border (FB/CNTC)

**Current situation:** Information partly available on TP, i.e. for country borders

**Recommendation:**

- Make it available for all BZ borders

## Use of the grid (FB/CNTC)

**Current status:** no publication

**Possible next step:** Further information on Reliability Margin and on forecast versus realized flows

# Recommendations to TSOs and CCRs on the publication of ex-post indicators

## Non-costly remedial actions applied

**Current status:** no publication

**Recommendation:**

- No publication, as there is no good indicator (dependant on too many factors)

## Redispatching

**Current status:** Hourly cross-border volumes and monthly costs available on ENTSO-E TP (internal national RD should be available by the end of 2018 in TP)

**Recommendation:**

- Ensure that internal national RD should be available by the end of 2018 in TP (ongoing development)
- Publish redispatching information in the BZ Technical report in a transparent way

**Possible next step:** Increase the granularity in the information published (smaller geographical scale than country scale, for example per BZ or control area)

## Curtailment

**Current status:** publish legal reasons for capacity curtailment, volume and duration

**Recommendation:**

- Publish additional details on the reasons for capacity curtailment and forecast of duration/effect

# General recommendation to ENTSO-E (as central party):

## Recommendation: Improve interfaces to get data

- 1- Harmonize access to data and further assess the possibility to display more data on ENTSO-E TP (or provide links to where the information can be found)
- 2- Make use of the ENTSO-E map ( <https://preview.entsoe.eu/data/map/>) and display thermal capacities of lines (where possible)
- 3- Improve use friendly interfaces: Work on maps to display CNECs taken into account in CC and limiting CC (where possible)